

# Guidelines for PES Pubs Volunteers

**Chair:** Nikos Hatziargyriou [nh@power.ece.ntua.gr](mailto:nh@power.ece.ntua.gr) (Past EiC, TPWRS)

**WG members:**

Ali Hooshyar <[hooshyar@ece.utoronto.ca](mailto:hooshyar@ece.utoronto.ca)> (AE, TSG)

Chung, Chi Yung <[c.y.chung@usask.ca](mailto:c.y.chung@usask.ca)> (Senior AE, TPWRS)

Federico Milano [Federico.Milano@ucd.ie](mailto:Federico.Milano@ucd.ie) (AE, TPWRS)

Florin Capitanescu <[florin.capitanescu@list.lu](mailto:florin.capitanescu@list.lu)> (AE, TSTE)

Gary W. Chang <[wchang@ee.ccu.edu.tw](mailto:wchang@ee.ccu.edu.tw)> (AE, TPWRD)

Shaahin Filizadeh <[Shaahin.Filizadeh@umanitoba.ca](mailto:Shaahin.Filizadeh@umanitoba.ca)> (AE, TEC)

Xiao-Ping Zhang [X.P.Zhang@bham.ac.uk](mailto:X.P.Zhang@bham.ac.uk) (AE, OAJPE)

June 10, 2022



## Scope

This WG was created by Bikash Pal, VP Publications in January 2022. Its membership includes senior representatives from the 5 PES Trans journals, namely TPWRS, TSG, TPWRD, TSTE and TEC which follow similar procedures in paper submissions and evaluations. The Scope of the brochure is to provide a manual with Guidelines for PES Pubs Volunteers based on the WG members experiences and good practices for all PES Pubs officers and volunteers.

### **Editor in Chief (EiC)<sup>1</sup>**

#### ***Functions***

A. The Editor-in-Chief has the highest authority on the publication on editorial matters, as defined in Subsection 2.4.2. There shall be one Editor-in-Chief for each IEEE refereed publication at any given point in time.

B. Assures that the content follows the approved scope of the publication.

#### ***Duties and Responsibilities***

A. Leads an editorial board (or equivalent) which consists of Associate Editors who assist in the editorial aspects of the publication. The editorial board may also include temporary editors, such as “guest editors” assigned to oversee special sections and special topical issues. In all cases, other editors should have defined terms of service.

B. Manages the peer review process in order to publish high-quality articles consistent with accepted IEEE standards and the scope of subject areas approved for the publication.

C. Delegates responsibility, as necessary, for various publication activities to other editors of the publication but retains ultimate responsibility for the editorial process. For non-trivial activities delegation of duties should require consent from VP Publication

D. In conformance with Subsection 8.2.3 Appeal of Editorial Decisions, assures that a procedure is in place to resolve any editorial or peer review challenge. He/she can consult the Senior Editor

E. Assures the sponsoring organizational unit does not interfere or influence editorial procedures or decisions regarding the acceptance or rejection of individual submissions.

---

<sup>1</sup> (IEEE PSPB Operations Manual, Amended 21 November 2021 (211229), Section 2.4)

F. Provides written acknowledgment of the receipt of a submission to the author. This acknowledgment should include the date by which the author can expect to receive the decision on the suitability of the submission for publication, which shall be no longer than 90 days from the date of the receipt of the article by the EiC.

G. Advises the submitting author of the relevant principles concerning material submitted for publication, especially the contents of Subsection 8.2 Publication Principles and Guidelines.

H. Examines the comments of the referees and exercises his or her best judgment, in the light of the referees' recommendations, on whether or not to publish. While this decision may be delegated to another editor of the publication, the Editor-in-Chief is ultimately accountable for the final decision. Reviewers' comments and annotated articles are normally returned to the author in any case.

I. Assures that the anonymity of the AE and the reviewers is protected during the review process.

J. Attends and participates in the PRAC review, when asked for, and the annual meeting of the IEEE Panel of Technical Publication Editors.

### ***Qualifications***

A. Must be at least an IEEE Senior Member

B. Must be able to commit a significant amount of time to the position.

C. Should have the support of his/her employer in meeting the obligations of the position.

D. Must have passed at least 15 years after graduation

### ***Appointment***

A. EiC appointments shall be limited to a reasonable duration as determined by the sponsoring IEEE organizational unit(s) of the publication.

B. For PES periodical EiC is appointed for a maximum of 2 terms, 3 years each.

C. An EiC may be exceptionally re-appointed one more time to a term of reasonable duration as determined by the sponsoring IEEE organizational unit(s) of the publication.

D. Appointments and re-appointments shall be approved by the governing body of the sponsoring IEEE organizational unit(s) of the publication

## **The Editor in Chief at Large (EiC at Large)**

### ***Functions***

Helps the VP Pubs in planning and day-to-day operations and setting up publication strategy and volunteer mentoring.

### ***Duties and Responsibilities***

A. Assigns and processes papers authored/co-authored by the EiCs or papers deemed by the EiCs as having a conflict of interest.

B. Leads the training program for AEs

C. Provides Guidelines to EiCs

D. Evaluates and provides recommendations on AEs nominated by the EiCs.

### ***Qualifications***

Is selected among the past EiCs. Past EiCs, who have stepped down in the last 5 years, can apply for this post.

### ***Selection Procedure***

VP Pubs will set up a transparent procedure, and he/she is ultimately responsible for this selection. The current practice is an EiC retiring from one Periodical will replace the current EiC at Large. If there are more than one EiCs retiring at the same time – VP Pubs will pick one of them based on the interest, as well as his/her past engagement record with general PES Publications' new initiative and strategic matters beyond his/her transactions.

### ***Appointments***

Two years.

## **The Senior Consulting Editor (Senior CE)**

### ***Functions***

Assists the VP Pubs and EIC of a relevant journal in policy issues and long-term planning. This role is specific to a periodical based on the need from the EIC.

### ***Duties and Responsibilities***

- A. Identifies Best Practices and updates the “Recommendations for Pubs Volunteers” manual.
- B. Oversees the conformity and homogeneity of PES Trans procedures, where applicable. Informs EiC about Best Practices applied in the PES journals.
- C. Enhances the industrial relevance of IEEE Trans. Deals with industrial papers, performing AE’s duties, if requested by the EiC
- D. Is responsible for transferring papers relevant to industry to Power and Energy Magazine or IEEE Electrification Magazine, in collaboration with the EiC and the authors
- E. Helps Evaluate and provide recommendations on the AEs nominations made by the EiC
- F. Supports and develops the promotion and outreach activities under the direction of EiC and VP Pubs

### ***Qualifications***

Is selected among past EiCs. Past EiCs, who have stepped down in the last 5 years, can apply for this post.

Industrial experience is strongly desirable. Industrial collaborations, consultations or research with significant industrial involvement is mandatory.

### ***Selection Procedure***

VP Pubs might set up a transparent procedure, but he/she is ultimately responsible for this selection.

### ***Appointments***

At least two years. The maximum duration of term is decided by the VP Pubs.

## **Associate Editors (AE)**

### ***Function***

AEs have primary responsibility to a transaction and to its authors in providing well informed and fair recommendations to the EiC about the suitability of the submitted paper for publication, resubmission or rejection.

### ***Duties and Responsibilities***

- A. They select suitable reviewers and provide recommendations considering their reviews. They are ultimately responsible for their recommendations independent of the reviewers' suggestions.
- B. They should make sure that to the best of their knowledge, recommendations to the EiC are based on well justified scientific grounds and adhere to excellence
- C. They are responsible for the timeliness of their recommendations
- D. They are responsible for justifying their recommendations in case of authors' appeals or for reversing their recommendation if convinced by opposing arguments.
- E. They should try to avoid any perceived conflict of interest as best as possible. The AE training materials will have details on the conflict of interest.
- F. He/she helps the EiC with author-initiated appeals/complaints.

### ***Selection criteria***

1. Field of specialization: An AE is expected to be an experienced and internationally recognized researcher or practitioner in one of the fields that are covered by the PES Trans. scope.
2. Research or industry experiences: An AE needs to be very familiar with the developments in their field of specialization and are expected to be internationally recognized research leaders in certain areas, who know and are known to the active researchers in the field. This level of reputation and experience will enable the person to attract proper reviewers and make a sound assessment on the reviewer comments.
3. AEs should be considered at least 10 years after completing a bachelor level or engineering diploma university education. IEEE Senior Membership is desirable.
4. Significant publication record in IEEE Transactions journals or exceptional journals/conferences of equivalent quality that adhere to the principles of ethical publishing.
5. Strong record of recent PES Trans. paper review history.
6. They should not be AE in more than two IEEE journals and one non- IEEE journal during appointment.
7. The need: AEs are appointed by the editorial board when there is a perceived need. A need arises when increased papers are submitted in a specific field, a new field emerges, or an existing AE retires.

Often, the editorial board will proactively search for qualified candidates in areas of need. Individuals who are passionate about paper publications and can satisfy the first four requirements are welcome to write to Editor-in-Chief (EiC) or PES Publications at [PES-Editorapp@ieee.org](mailto:PES-Editorapp@ieee.org) with the periodical title in the subject line.

### ***Process***

The editor appointment process is as follows:

1. AEs are generally selected following an open call for interest published once a year around October for appointment in January next year. Candidate AEs submit CVs, publication records and editorial experience according to the requirements of the call. They are invited to explain how they fulfill the criteria.
2. Potential AEs may also be identified by the EiC or 3rd party. They are encouraged to apply through the open call or send applications to PES-Editorapp@ieee.org.
3. The candidate is given information on the responsibilities, expectations and guidelines of PES Trans editorial work.
4. EiC evaluates the detailed CV and checks the review records of the candidate if the candidate agrees with the job requirements. EiC also needs to consider the diversity of the editorial board such as geography, gender, area of expertise, and work sector.
5. EiC consults with the EiC at Large and the Senior CE and nominates the candidate to VP-Publication of PES for approval.
6. The candidate is appointed if approved by PES Publications Board. More detailed information is provided to the appointee to assist his/her work.
7. It is mandatory that AEs follow an AE training process organized by the PES Publication Board within first six months of appointment.
8. Poor performing AEs may be asked to step down prior to termination of their term of appointment, at the discretion of the EiC.

### ***Duration***

The appointment period is 2 years per term, and it can be renewed consecutively for 2 additional terms. In case of exceptional merits, the appointment can be extended beyond 6 years, subject to approval of the VP Pubs.

## **Senior AE**

### ***Functions:***

Assists the EiC in day-to-day operations.

### ***Duties and Responsibilities***

- A. Assists the EiC in solving conflicts between AEs and authors, provides recommendations on authors' appeals.
- B. Assists the EiC in selection of best papers and author recognition
- C. Produces quarterly, or on demand by EiC, reports on performance of the editorial board based on defined metrics

- D. looks after author resource and Training and updates regularly authors resource center and training in the journal home page
- E. Provides guidance to prospective authors, reviewers and associate editors
- F. Enhances the transparency of the review process through authors guidance and enhanced engagement with the authors and reviewers
- G. Help the EiC to evaluate ‘technically weak’ papers during paper submission through Editorial Rejection.

### ***Process/ Selection criteria***

Selected by the EiC from the list of existing AEs.

### ***Duration***

Initially for two years with a possibility to be renewed till the end of the term of the appointing EiC. Their appointment can be renewed by the incoming EiC.

The EiC can terminate their appointment at earlier date if the performance falls short of the expected standard.

### **Paper Review Process<sup>2</sup>**

After a paper is submitted, the administrative assistant first screens it to check basic compliance with the submission requirements of PES papers. If a paper passes this screening, it is then transferred to the EiC.

The EiC does a first technical screening, such as compliance with scope, degree of similarity, quality of presentation, paper resubmission etc. The papers that do not meet the required criteria can be editorially rejected with a possible recommendation to be transferred to other PES Transactions papers. This task can be assigned fully or partly to the Senior Editor. Papers that pass this first phase are assigned to a suitable AE based on their expertise and workload.

The AE does one more technical screening to determine if a paper satisfies the scope and a minimum degree of contributions. If a paper is not ready for review, he/she returns it to the EiC recommending editorial rejection with a note to the authors to fix the minor issues and resubmit as fresh paper. If a paper passes this screening, the editor determines what is the expertise needed and invites suitable reviewers. Initially, a number of three to five reviewers is recommended. In addition to the expertise in the topic, the reviewers should be selected considering the research expertise (seniority) and geographical location. In case of very conflicting reviews where opinions are divided, AE can add another experienced reviewer for another independent opinion.

The reviewers are recommended to evaluate the assigned paper from four aspects:

---

<sup>2</sup> (Supplementary to IEEE PSPB Operations Manual, Amended 21 November 2021 (211229), Section 8.2.1 D)

- 1) Quality of subject: if the paper's topic is of high and timely interest to journal's readers;
- 2) Quality of contribution: if the paper contains original, innovative and high impact contributions;
- 3) Quality of research: if paper has demonstrated its contributions through rigorous technical and scientific analysis;
- 4) Quality of presentation: if the texts and illustrations are effective in communicating the work.

The following suggestions are recommended when completing the review:

- 1) Provide comments to support the rating and recommendation. The editorial board cannot rely on ratings without support comments;
- 2) Very short and ill-informed review should be ignored;
- 3) As the comments will be forwarded the author anonymously, they must be fair, concise, constructive, and considerate;
- 4) If mandatory changes are required, they should be clear as to what must be done to make the paper acceptable;
- 5) Avoid using ambiguous "decision" statements in the comments;
- 6) Separate comments about the paper can be included for consideration by the AE/EiC, where the "decision" statements are suggested.

The AE evaluates the review results. They must pay special attention to the comments of the reviewers. Only reviews with adequate comments should be taken into account. The AE then makes a recommendation to EiC. The recommendation should rely on reviewers' comments, rather than their recommendations and should not be based on a "majority vote". AEs may provide additional feedback to the paper that was not covered by the reviewers.

AE's recommendations must clearly provide to the authors a convincing rationale for editorial decisions regarding their paper. This is especially important if the article is recommended to be rejected. This written rationale should summarize the main weaknesses of the paper, the reasons for rejection and the mandatory changes required in case of resubmissions. The EiC studies the recommendation of the editor and the comments of the reviewers and may contact the AE for clarifications or further discussions. They might request a reverse of recommendation, ask for additional reviews or reverse the recommendation himself. They are ultimately accountable for the acceptance, resubmission or rejection of a paper.

Decisions about acceptance for publication should occur in a reasonable time frame, and (except for issues devoted to special topics) articles should, to the EiC's best ability, be published in the chronological order of acceptance.

If the AE recognizes that the rejected paper has certain value, but the concerns raised by the reviewers cannot be addressed in a simple revision, the EiC rejects that paper, but invites it to be resubmitted after a major revision. The authors are strongly encouraged to conduct substantially further research, improve the writing, and submit their work as a new paper. To encourage significant efforts to improve the paper, the EiC will consider the new submission only after some reasonable amount of time after rejection. The authors should indicate in the cover letter that the paper was rejected before, and its resubmission is encouraged by

the EiC. They might include a response to the reviewer comments in a separate file. The authors might also suggest that their paper is assigned to the same AE or a different one for EiC's consideration.

If authors are not satisfied with the decision about their paper, they can appeal to EiC. The EiC studies the authors' arguments, the AE's recommendations, the reviews, and the paper and after consulting with the AE, they might confirm or reverse the decision. They might consult the Senior Editor and additional reviewers.

### Integrity of Paper Review Process<sup>3</sup>

1. All editors of IEEE publications (EiC and AEs) shall adhere to the highest standards of ethical publishing in handling submissions to the publication (see also Principles of Ethical Publishing). Actions taken by any editor generally intended to manipulate the peer review process for any article submitted for review shall be considered serious misconduct and may result in sanctions levied on that editor.
2. All assignments of EiC to AEs and of AEs to reviewers must carefully avoid conflicts of interest. Conflict of interest might arise as a result of direct, or indirect, personal, academic, financial or working relationships. Examples of such relationships are, student-professor, same university colleagues, research collaborators, company relationships, family relationships, etc. AEs or reviewers who face conflict of interest should declare this relationship and resign from performing the duty.
3. Requests by an author who asks, when submitting a paper, that particular individual(s) be excluded from the review of that article should be carefully considered by the EiC and the AE. The requesting author must explain the reasons and it is up to the EiC and the AE to ignore/accept this request based on circumstances. Similarly, the EiC and the AE can ignore the author's request of preferential reviewers. Maximum one and preferably none of suggested reviewers can be invited.
4. Papers authored/co-authored by EiCs  
A paper authored/co-authored by the EiC submitted to the IEEE Trans that they serve as EiC, is processed by the EiC-at-Large, who is appointed by the VP Pubs to process EiC related papers. The review process is completely invisible to the EiC and the EiC is treated just like any other author. This approach upholds the integrity of the review process on one hand and allows the EiCs to publish papers in the transactions of his/her choice.  
PES transactions do not allow guest lead Editors of special issues to submit papers for their special issues or sections. Guest Lead Editor's paper will be treated as regular submission and will be handled by EiC. If the paper is accepted, it can be published along with the special section if desired by the Guest Lead Editors.
5. Papers authored/co-authored by editorial board members

---

<sup>3</sup> Supplementary to IEEE PSPB Operations Manual, Amended 21 November 2021 (211229), Section 8.2.1 D

These papers are processed by the EiC as any regular paper. Unrelated editors are assigned to process the papers. Submission of papers by guest editorial board members to their special sections is restricted to max one.

6. Papers authored/co-authored by IEEE TF/WG Members

Such paper may exceed in initial 10 pages but must be treated as any other paper for technical assessment in peer review.

7. Unpublished articles must be treated as confidential documents by all individuals involved in the editorial process.

### Special Sections/Issues

Special sections/issues aim to publish original research papers and visionary reviews on technologies, algorithms, and case studies associated with the latest state-of-the-art in power systems. Usually one special section a year is norm in the age of digital publications. Papers that can be covered by publications in regular issues should be avoided. It is expected that the proposed special sections/issues should significantly promote the scholarly advancement of power engineering research. The topics of proposed special sections/issues are also expected to strengthen the publication of industrial achievements and/or attract the interest of a broader readership from multiple research communities. Proposal must have good mix of papers from academia and industry. Cross society joint special sections are more welcome. Proposal to launch a special section/issue shall be approved by the PES Publication Board.

#### **Additional Information for Special Sections/Issues Papers**

- Although each CFP has a deadline for paper submission, authors are encouraged to submit their papers before the deadline (the earlier the better). This will enable early start of the paper review and early electronic publication of accepted papers. In addition, editors and reviewers are less overloaded before the deadline. They will have more time and energy to take care of early submitted papers.
- To accommodate the request for extension of submission deadlines by authors, the various milestones specified in a CFP may have to be delayed. Such information is not updated regularly here. Experience has shown that special section papers take longer time to publish. The main factor is that a special section can only be published when all or most accepted papers have passed proofreading. A delay on anyone of the papers can delay the entire group of papers. So PES Publications recommend authors to make their best effort to respond early.

# Recognition

## Transaction Best Papers

The editorial board selects the best transaction papers each year for the Transactions Best Paper Awards. The papers are selected from candidate papers that are nominated by the editors and published during the past three years. The final selection is made by the EiC in collaboration with the Senior Editor.

The following selection criteria should apply for Best Paper Awards:

1. Level of novelty and contributions of the paper.
2. Impacts of the paper on the reader community of the transaction (e.g., opinions of invited experts, through citation and download numbers, etc.).

The award is presented at the Transaction Best Paper Award Ceremony organized by the Senior Editor. The Transaction Best papers can be presented by the authors in a suitable webinar.

## PES Prize Papers

The IEEE Power & Energy Society selects two best transaction papers each year for PES Prize Paper Award. The papers are selected among all six PES transaction and PES OA journal that are published during the past three years from October 1 to September 30. The award is presented at the PES General Meeting in the coming year. Candidate papers are nominated by various technical committees and editorial boards of PES transactions. Each committee/board can nominate one paper.

## Outstanding Associate Editors

The EiC selects the outstanding editors from the list of outgoing editors to recognize their significant contributions to the journal. The following factors are considered in the selection process:

- Overall quality of the review process for the papers handled by the associate editors. This includes the editor comments, justification, insights and guidance to the authors
- Average number of papers handled by the editors each year
- Average turn-around time for the review process for the papers handled by the associate editors