

IEEE Power & Energy Society
Author's Kit
(Part 5 last revised July 2008)

Part 5: **Discussions and Closures**

Discussions form a most valuable adjunct to a Transactions paper and are strongly encouraged. Discussions and closures are published for Transactions papers only, not Proceedings papers. As with the paper itself, discussion deadlines (see below) are not tied to meeting dates. Be aware that discussions cannot be accepted if they are received after the deadline. *There is no formula which determines when discussions and closures will be printed relative to the issue in which the original paper was published, though all discussions and the closure for a given paper will be published together.*

All discussions must provide contributions through questions and/or additional information on the subject of the papers. Congratulatory discussions are discouraged and are subject to elimination. Combined discussions of two or more papers are not acceptable unless they refer to companion papers.

The author's closure is a response to the written discussion and must cover only the areas and questions raised by the discussers.

It is recommended that discussions and closures be limited to one formatted page including figures and tables, though contributions of up to 1500 words will be accepted. Discussions and closures may be rejected if they exceed the page limit.

Discussion Deadline

When an issue of a PES Transactions has been published, a list of the papers in the issue is posted on the PES web site along with links to their abstracts in IEEE Xplore[®]. The deadline for submitting discussions is posted as well. The deadline is 90 days from the issue date of the Transactions in which the paper has been published. Discussions must be submitted to the PES Executive Office by the posted deadline date. (Please note: If a discussion is submitted prior to the paper being published in a specific issue of the Transactions, it will be some time before the discussion is processed.)

Discussion and Closure Routing

The PES Executive Office will forward copies of all written discussions to the corresponding author of the subject Transactions paper and will request that a written closure be submitted. The closure should cover only the areas and questions raised by the discussers. Closures must be submitted within three weeks (five weeks outside of North and Central America) of the request. If there is no response by the deadline, it is assumed that no closure will be supplied and the discussion will be published with the following note: "Closure was not provided by the Author."

Discussions and closures are routed to the Transactions Editor-in-Chief for final approval before release for publication. Four weeks are allowed for approval by the EIC.

Discussion and Closure Format

When preparing a discussion or closure, follow the same guidelines used for the preparation of a PES technical work (see Part 4 of the Author's Kit). Note, however, that discussions and closures do not contain abstracts, keywords, and biographies. Discussions and closures are considered final drafts that, upon acceptance by the EIC, are ready to be printed without further content changes.

The name and affiliation (including city and country) of each discussor or closer and the title of the discussion or closure must appear on the manuscript.

Discussion Submission

In order for a discussion to be reviewed, the following must be submitted:

- Hard Copy: Five (5) copies of the formatted discussion, with any graphics incorporated.
- Hard Copy: Five (5) high-quality scannable copies of each graphic (if applicable), labeled with file name, etc.
- Hard Copy: Two (2) copies of Discussion Submission Cover Sheet.
- Hard Copy: Completed and signed [IEEE Copyright Form](#) (original and one photocopy). (The discussion title and the number of the paper being discussed should be included on the copyright form.)
- Electronic: File of the entire formatted discussion, including graphics (if any), in MS Word (for PC).
- Electronic: File of the entire formatted discussion, including graphics (if any), in PDF (for PC), with the Discussion Submission Cover Sheet appended to the beginning of the file with a page break.
- Electronic: TIFF, EPS, or PS file for each graphic (if applicable).

Submit all materials to:

Discussion Submission
IEEE PES Executive Office
445 Hoes Lane
P.O. Box 1331
Piscataway, NJ 08855-1331 USA

Proof of the Discussion or Closure

The process of preparing a manuscript for publication can, on occasion, change, delete, or modify characters and equations. A proof of the manuscript will be sent to the corresponding author for review and approval. **It is essential that the proof be checked as thoroughly as possible since the responsibility for the final text is the author's.** Please note when checking your proof:

- Text has been edited to IEEE style.
- **Check all mathematics and equations very carefully. It is the author's responsibility to verify that they have converted properly.** (Note: TeX and LaTeX documents are more likely to be converted properly with the rest of the text. Equations in other formats generally must be re-keyed.)
- Check all figures and tables and verify that they are numbered correctly.
- If any authors are members of the IEEE, please provide their membership grade and years of grade.

Failure to return the corrected proof in the allotted time frame will result in deferring the discussion and closure to a future issue.

Posting on IEEE Xplore[®]

A new publication procedure began in 2004. Accepted papers (including accepted discussions and closures) are processed for publication before they are scheduled for a specific issue of the Transactions. When the corrected proof has been returned and the changes have been incorporated, the paper is posted on IEEE Xplore[®] as "Accepted for Future Publication." Please note that, due to the number of papers awaiting publication, this procedure is being implemented gradually.